FLINTSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

- REPORT TO: PLANNING COMMITTEE
- DATE: <u>28TH JUNE 2017</u>

REPORT BY: CHIEF OFFICER (PLANNING AND ENVIRONMENT)

SUBJECT:APPEAL BY MR. R. FURSE AGAINST THE
DECISION OF FLINTSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL TO
REFUSE PLANNING PERMISSION FOR THE
CONVERSION AND EXTENSION OF REDUNDANT
PIGGERIES TO STORE VEHICLES AND GARDEN
EQUIPMENT FOR THE BENEFIT OF THE EXISTING
DWELLING AT NERQUIS HALL, NERCWYS –
DISMISSED.

1.00 APPLICATION NUMBER

1.01 050788

2.00 APPLICANT

2.01 Mr. R. Furse

3.00 <u>SITE</u>

3.01 Nerquis Hall, Nercwys.

4.00 APPLICATION VALID DATE

4.01 11th September 2013.

5.00 PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 5.01 To inform Members of a decision in respect of an appeal following the grant to planning consent for the conversion and extension of the piggeries building to store vehicles and garden equipment in association with Nerquis Hall, Nercwys, Mold, Flintshire CH7 4EB by the Local Planning Authority.
- 5.02 The application was refused via officer delegated powers on the 25th May 2016.
- 5.03 The appointed Planning Inspector was Vicky Hirst and was

considered following the exchange of written representations, the appeal was **DISMISSED**.

6.00 <u>REPORT</u>

The Main Issue

6.01 The Inspector considered the main issue in relation to the appeal was whether the proposed works and development would preserve the listed buildings or their settings, or any features of special architectural or historic interest which they possess and whether the proposed works and development would protect and conserve the registered parkland and garden and its setting.

Background

6.02 The Inspector noted the listing of the main house Nerquis Hall as a grade 1 listed building and its associated group of stone outbuildings arranged around a courtyard, they were also listed in their own right as grade 11 and where listed for their group value. There are also a number of other listed buildings and structures within the grounds, including garden walls, a folly and orangery and gates. In addition to this it was also noted that 2.7 acres of the parkland land and gardens that surround Nerquis Hall are registered as historic park and garden evaluated to a grade 2. The primary reason for this grading is due to the partial survival of an early 18th C form and layout with unusual garden and park buildings.

The Piggeries

- 6.03 The Inspector noted that the piggeries buildings were in poor repair, however that the principle elevation, which faces the main courtyard, remain clearly legible with its five arched openings largely intact. Whilst the brick partitions dividing the sties and the mono pitch roof to the rear are in poor repair the original form and layout of the piggery building is clearly evident.
- 6.04 Whilst the arched openings of the piggeries would be retained in the proposed scheme, the extension and excavation proposed to the rear of the building in order to facilitate the proposed vehicle store, would mean that only the front elevation of the arched openings would be the only original element of the building to remain. Much visual reference would be lost through the removal of the most of the internal sty portioning. The Inspector drew on the advice of Circular 61/96 that states that the preservation of a façade alone and the gutting and reconstruction of the interior, is not normally acceptable, as it destroys the buildings special interest, the Inspector concurred with this advice.
- 6.05 In addition the Inspector considered that the change of levels, the longer roof and higher vertical walling to accommodate the scheme would considerably alter the overall proportions of the building, with the scheme proposed dominating the original scale and form of the

building, resulting in loss of the historical association with the wider estate as a small and subservient service building. The works and development would not preserve the special qualities and setting of this building or the wider group.

Creation of an Additional Courtyard

6.06 The Inspector considered that the creation of the access to serve the garage proposed would lead to a further courtyard being created. This would be located to the north of the site and would be shared space for the garage and the biomass / store building and external store area, this would change the emphasis away from the main courtyard and would be at odds with the original design of the overall estate. This would not preserve the setting of the listed buildings of Nerquis Hall and associated stable buildings.

New Use to Ensure the Reuse of the Building

6.07 The Inspector noted the advice in Planning Policy for flexibility in relation to finding alternative uses to be considered to secure a buildings survival, and in this instance the Inspector considers that the buildings walls have no inherent defect of weakness in the walls that prohibits it being brought back in to a new use without adverse effects arising from the proposal.

Registered Historic Park and Garden

- 6.08 The Inspector noted that the main designated garden is located away from the piggeries buildings, with the piggeries lying within the northern part of the registered park, although the works proposed are small in the context of the overall park and given the close association with the host building it was not considered to adversely impact upon the setting of the register park and garden.
- 6.09 However the creation of the access and turning area proposed to the rear of the piggeries was considered to be at odds with the design of the estate, with the courtyards facing inwards away from the wider park and garden. The creation of a further vehicular turning area with the access to the garages facing the park area to the north would not follow the overall design philosophy, and found that this would not protect and conserve the setting of the registered park and garden.

7.00 <u>CONCLUSION</u>

7.01 For the reasons given above the Inspector concluded that the appeal be **DISMISSED**.

LIST OF BACKGROUND DOCUMENTS

Planning Application & Supporting Documents National & Local Planning Policy Responses to Consultation Responses to Publicity

Contact Officer:	Barbara Kinnear
Telephone:	(01352) 703260
Email:	barbara.kinnear@flintshire.gov.uk